

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 STATE 171119
ORIGIN ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 OES-07 /018 R

66011

DRAFTED BY ACDA/NP D. RUST

APPROVED BY ACDA/NP C. VAN DOREN

OES:R. SIMPKINS

-----027769 220121Z /63

O 220001Z JUL 77

FM SECSTATE WASHDC

TO USMISSION GENEVA IMMEDIATE

C O N F I D E N T I A L STATE 171119

FOR CTB DELEGATION

FOL RPT VIENNA 6664 ACTION SECSTATE INFO USERDA HQ WASHDC
USERDA HQ GERMANTOWN LONDON MOSCOW NEW DELHI OTTAWA BOMBAY
19 JUL 77 QUOTE

C O N F I D E N T I A L VIENNA 6664

USIAEA

DEPT PASS IO/SCT

EO 11652: GDS

TAGSC PARM, TECH, IAEA, IN, UR, CA

SUBJ: INDIA/IAEA NEGOTIATIONS OF SAFEGUARDS AGREEMENT IN
CONNECTION WITH USSR-SUPPLIED HEAVY WATER

REF: VIENNA 6663

1. FOLLOWING HIS TEXT OF SECRETARIAT PAPER MADE AVAILABLE
BY ACTING IAEA DIRECTOR GENERAL HALL TO US, UK, USSR
AND CANADIAN REPS AT JULY 15 MEETING REPORTED REFTEL.
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 STATE 171119

THE EXISTING CANADA/INDIA/IAEA AGREEMENT OF 1971 (STA)

1. THE CANADA/INDIA SAFEGUARDS AGREEMENT OF 1971 PROVIDES THAT
THE NUCLEAR MATERIAL USED OR PRODUCED IN THE RAJASTHAN ATOMIC
POWER STATION SHALL BE USED ONLY FOR PEACEFUL PURPOSES. THE
RAJASTHAN ATOMIC POWER STATION COMPRISES RAPP-1 AND HRAPP-2.

INDIA HAS STATED ON OTHER OCCASIONS THAT A PEACEFUL USE UNDERTAKING DOES NOT PRECLUDE THE MANUFACTURE OF A "PEACEFUL NUCLEAR EXPLOSIVE DEVICE". THE SAFEGUARDS PROCEDURES SET FORTH IN THE AGREEMENT ARE NOT CLEAR (BILATERAL SAFEGUARDS PROVISIONS HAVE BEEN INCORPORATED IN THE AGREEMENT) ALTHOUGH IT IS UNDERSTOOD THAT IN PRACTICE THERE ARE NO DIFFICULTIES IN APPLYING SAFEGUARDS TO RAPP-1.

2. THE AGREEMENT MAY BE TERMINATED AT ANY TIME BY ANY OF THE PARTIES UPON 6 MONTHS' NOTICE. IT IS ALSO DOUBTFUL WHETHER SUBSEQUENT GENERATIONS OF PRODUCED SPECIAL FISSIONABLE MATERIAL ARE UNDER SAFEGUARDS, EXCEPT MATERIAL DERIVED FROM SPECIAL FISSIONABLE MATERIAL PRODUCED DURING THE FIRST FIVE YEARS OF THE AGREEMENT (THIS IS BECAUSE THE FIRST SUPPLY OF HEAVY WATER WAS OF US ORIGIN AND THE AGREEMENT PROVIDES THAT THE ORIGINAL HEAVY WATER SHOULD BE REMOVED FROM THE SCOPE OF THE AGREEMENT BY RE-TRANSFER TO CANADA OR BY SUBSTITUTION AFTER FIVE YEARS).

3. ALTHOUGH THE DIRECTOR GENERAL, BY CABLES OF SEPTEMBER 1976 AND MARCH 1977, HAS REQUESTED URGENT CONSULTATIONS WITH THE PARTIES "WITH A VIEW TO ESTABLISHING CONDITIONS FOR EFFECTIVE AGENCY SAFEGUARDS CONSISTENT WITH CURRENT SAFEGUARDS APPROACHES", AND HAS STATED THAT IN THE INTERIM ALL CONDITIONS APPLICABLE DURING THE INITIAL FIVE YEAR PERIOD SHOULD CONTINUE TO APPLY, INDIA HAS ONLY REPLIED THAT THE "WHOLE MATTER WAS UNDER REVIEW". CANADA HAS EXPRESSED WILLINGNESS TO PARTICIPATE IN THESE CONSULTATIONS.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 STATE 171119

NO CONSULTATIONS HAVE BEEN TAKEN SO FAR WITH A VIEW TO REACHING A SATISFACTORY SOLUTION.

4. THERE IS ALSO A DIFFERENCE OF OPINION BETWEEN CANADA AND INDIA ON US HEAVY WATER SUBSTITUTION. INDIA HOLDS THAT THE US HEAVY WATER IS DEEMED TO HAVE BEEN SUBSTITUTED IN CANADA BY CANADIAN HEAVY WATER, WHEREAS CANADA'S POSITION IS THAT NO SUBSTITUTION HAS AS YET OCCURRED. THIS IS OF RELEVANCE IN RELATION TO THE APPLICATION OF SAFEGUARDS TO SUBSEQUENT GENERATIONS OF SPECIAL FISSIONABLE MATERIAL AFTER THE INITIAL 5-YEAR PERIOD.

5. IN SUMMARY THE EXISTING SAFEGUARDS SITUATION ON RAPP-1 AND RAPP-2 IS NOT IN ACCORDANCE WITH PRESENT SAFEGUARDS POLICIES AND PRACTICES AND THERE IS A DIFFERENCE OF OPINION BETWEEN THE TWO GOVERNMENTS INVOLVED ON A BASIC ISSUE.. THERE HAS BEEN NO INDICATION THAT INDIA WOULD BE PREPARED TO UPGRADE THE EXISTING STA. IN FACT, ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENCY'S PROPOSALS TO INDIA IN RELATION TO SOVIET HEAVY WATER WOULD HAVE RESULTED IN AN UPGRADING OF THE STA, WHICH WOULD THEN IN PRACTICE HAVE BEEN SUPERSEDED BY THE NEW - AGREEMENT.

THE PROPOSED AGREEMENT TO COVER THE SOVIET HEAVY WATER

6. THE SAFEGUARDS DOCUMENT DOES NOT DIRECTLY ADDRESS A SITUATION SUCH AS THE SUPPLY OF HEAVY WATER FOR A REACTOR. IT MUST BE BORNE IN MIND, HOWEVER, THAT PARAGRAPH 19 OF PART II OF INFCIRC/66/REF.2 (CIRCUMSTANCES REQUIRING SAFEGUARDS) HAS BEEN MODIFIED IN PRACTICE, AS THE SCOPE OF SAFEGUARDS AGREEMENTS IS CONSIDERABLY BROADER THAN ENVISAGED BY THE DOCUMENT.

7. THE HEAVY WATER MUST BE REGARDED AS A CRUCIAL PART OF THE PLANT AS IT IS INDISPENSIBLE FOR RAPP-2 TO COMMENCE OPERATION. THE USE OF THE HEAVY WATER IN THE PLANT IS NOT MERELY OF A TRANSITORY NATURE WHICH COULD JUSTIFY THE INCLUSION OF THE FACILITY IN THE SUBSIDIARY PART OF THE INVENTORY. THIS IS ALSO CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 STATE 171119

QUITE CLEAR FROM INFCIRC/209 (MEMORANDUM B) WHICH SPECIFIES THAT SOURCE OR SPECIAL FISSIONABLE MATERIAL PRODUCED, PROCESSED OR USED IN A FACILITY FOR WHICH "TRIGGER LIST" ITEMS ARE SUPPLIED SHALL NOT BE DIVERTED TO NUCLEAR WEAPONS OR OTHER NUCLEAR EXPLOSIVE DEVICES AND THAT SAFEGUARDS WOULD HAVE TO BE APPLIED TO

IN PARTICULAR COV/1621.

THE MATERIAL IN QUESTION. AS HEAVY WATER IS AN ITEM ON THE "TRIGGER LIST" ANY FACILITY FOR WHICH THE HEAVY WATER IS SUPPLIED MUST ALSO COME UNDER SAFEGUARDS PERMANENTLY. (A RECENT EXAMPLE IS THE SAFEGUARDS

AGREEMENT WITH THE DEMOCRATIC PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF KOREA INVOLVING THE SUPPLY OF FUEL FOR A RESEARCH REACTOR. THE AGREEMENT COVERS BOTH

THE REACTOR (PERMANENTLY) AND THE FUEL).

8. THE AGENCY'S TECHNICAL STAFF DOES NOT CONSIDER THAT THE PRESENT DESIGN OF THE PLANT WOULD PERMIT A SEPARATION OF THE HEAVY WATER STREAMS. SOVIET SUPPLIED HEAVY WATER WOULD THUS GET MIXED WITH HEAVY WATER PRESENTLY IN RAPP-1. THIS IS AN ADDITIONAL REASON WHY THE NEW AGREEMENT SHOULD COVER BOTH RAPP-1 AND RAPP-2.

9. THE PROPOSED AGREEMENT PROVIDES FOR THE POSSIBILITY TO SUBSTITUTE INDIAN HEAVY WATER FOR SOVIET HEAVY WATER. THE REACTOR STATION WOULD THEN BE REMOVED FROM THE SCOPE OF THE AGREEMENT, UNLESS THERE IS A CLEAR STATEMENT THAT THE STATION ITSELF IS PERMANENTLY UNDER SAFEGUARDS TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE TERMINATION PROVISIONS OF THE CANADA/INDIA/IAEA AGREEMENT THIS WOULD HAVE THE EFFECT OF TERMINATING ALL SAFEGUARDS ON THE RAJASTHAN STATION.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 05 STATE 171119

10. FOR THE ABOVE REASONS THE DIRECTOR GENERAL WOULD NOT BE IN A
POSITION TO RECOMMEND TO THE BOARD THE APPROVAL OF THE AGREEMENT
UNLESS IT COVERS BOTH RAPP-1 AND RAPP-2 PERMANENTLY. STONE

UNQUOTE VANCE

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: SUPPLIES, AGREEMENTS, HEAVY WATER, NUCLEAR SAFEGUARDS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 22-Jul-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977STATE171119
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: NP D. RUST
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D770260-0635
Format: TEL
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770728/aaaaayed.tel
Line Count: 180
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: b4b85b65-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN ACDA
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 4
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 VIENNA 6663
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 09-Mar-2005 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 1774462
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: INDIA/IAEA NEGOTIATIONS OF SAFEGUARDS AGREEMENT IN CONNECTION WITH USSR-SUPPLIED HEAVY WATER
TAGS: PARM, TECH, CA, IN, UR, IAEA
To: GENEVA USIAEA
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/b4b85b65-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009